



**City of Brisbane Energy and Water Benchmarking Ordinance
Engagement Workshop #1
Mission Blue Center, 475 Mission Blue Drive, Brisbane, CA, US, 94005
Tuesday, April 9, 2019
1:00 - 2:30 p.m.**

Meeting Notes

Start Time: 1:10 PM

1. Opening Remarks: Madison Davis, City of Brisbane Mayor

- Definition of benchmarking
- Efficiencies and tracking emissions
- Identify opportunities to conserve
- Accomplishing goals of reductions

2. Climate Action Plan and BAAQMD Grant: Adrienne Etherton, City of Brisbane

- Purpose of the workshop: gather input to keep in mind as the benchmarking ordinance is drafted
- City of Brisbane adopted a Climate Action Plan (CAP) in 2015 to reduce GHG emissions
 - Currently tasked with implementing CAP
 - Benchmarking is one way to implement
 - Bay Area Air Quality Management District awarded the City of Brisbane with a climate protection grant
 - The grant is for energy and water approach for residential and multifamily
 - Phase 1: Development of the ordinance
 - Phase 2: Implementation of the ordinance
- Commercial building energy accounts for 30% of the city's emissions

3. Overview of Sustainability Trends: Marc Costa, The Energy Coalition

- A great cross-section of sectors and scales in attendance
- Review of ordinances around the state and country
- Overview of the California Building Energy Benchmarking Program (AB 802)
- Benchmarking 101
- *Audience question: Why wouldn't you use cubic feet when talking about energy consumption?*
 - *For HVAC- regardless of how high, only want comfort at occupancy level*
 - *Sqft makes sense as opposed to cubic feet*
 - *You may not care how hot or cold*
 - *Predetermined metrics include state and federal numbers*
- Most attendees have not benchmarked through any other local ordinance



- Benefits of Benchmarking
 - Decreased pollution
 - Economic boost
 - Reduce energy waste
 - Helps low-income customers
 - State saves money
 - Meets other climate goals
- Review of Brisbane's 5 values
 - Sustainability related feedback from Michelle (OSEC)- "what the city is doing is not currently sustainable"

4. Attendee Feedback: All

- *BiRite Store*
 - *Has benchmarking ever come to mind?*
 - *Thought about it for a long time, mostly electric, have received rebates*
- *PG&E*
 - *Have a number of programs including Savings by Design, ZNE Programs, etc that can be leveraged after a building owner benchmarks/audits a building.*
- *Ecology Action*
 - *PG&E Energy Watch program is available and has lots of lighting and other incentives / direct install programs; Provided BiRite with incentives & rebates and a free energy assessment.*
- *City of San Francisco*
 - *Reported overall reduction in energy use after benchmarking ordinance launched and they have drawn a 1-1 connection between benchmarking and energy reduction*
- *Verdafero*
 - *Shared their experience with SF ordinance*
 - *Benchmarking has value if done properly and the results really actionable*
 - *The average building owner likely does not want to voluntarily to benchmark, 99% say it's another tax but do it to check the box*
 - *Customers that took incentives from PGE mostly care about cost savings*
 - *In order for benchmarking to be successful, message it in a way to get building owners excited about it*
 - *Few building owners see benefit from just benchmarking, but it's actionable information or even auditing that gives the owner a roadmap to act*
 - *Very rare that people do it for the right reasons*
 - *The average building owners will take the lowest price consultant and benchmarking data isn't useful in that case*
- *Ecology Action*



- *Have completed audits for the hospitality industry and owners not receptive to complex services*
- *Look at it from a Local Government perspective - why is the city interested in launching an ordinance*
 - *In order to act at the city scale, information is needed as a baseline; “you can't manage what you don't measure”*
 - *Information from the assessor alone isn't enough to help make programs and planning decisions to meet Climate Action Plan goals; so start with building inventory through the benchmarking ordinance*
 - *Actionable data for the city, or even for building owners are not always known, understood or organized*
- **ASHRAE**
 - *Lots of membership are consulting engineers*
 - *Offer benchmarking services based on audits*
 - *Anything that helps you understand how much energy is being used, ASHRAE is fully behind*
 - *Large focus on ROI in driving projects and investments*
 - *At city level, identify which buildings types to go after in the ordinance - ensure there is a 'rhyme and reason' for targeting buildings in the ordinance*
 - *Commercial, certain age, building types,*
 - *When was building permitted?*
 - *Working with building to educate them on rebate programs available is important*
 - *If you look at 30%, want to hit the large slices within building sector in Brisbane*
- **Verdafero**
 - *Cost of audits can be expensive*

5. Challenge, Value & Best Practice Poster Activity

- [Results](#)

6. Poster Activity Recap

- *Should encouragement be based on penalties or recognition/positives?*
- *Challenge: the program should have a strong PR method before it even launches*
 - *Level-setting of expectations will be important*
- *Request to share actual case studies to show how benchmarking was done and the benefits received*
 - *Benchmarking champions or early adopters can be helpful*
- *If a building is older and the owner completes an audit, and they want to take action, they will hit a threshold and have to meet building code*
 - *Building owner doesn't want to do it to take it past a certain point*
 - *Ex. Cow Palace*



- *Auditing increases the level of effort*
- *Benchmarking leads to audit identification - to then know what improvements to make*
- *Energy Star Portfolio Manager is the go-to tool for benchmarking throughout the country*
- *Verdafero: Largest hurdle is getting utility data*
- *Would like to run a copy of ordinance by building owners*
 - *Categorize buildings accordingly*
 - *New highrises or industrial warehouse*

End Time: 2:37 PM

Engagement Activity Results - Workshop #1 City of Brisbane Energy & Water Benchmarking Ordinance

Challenge			
Prompt	Strongly Disagree	Neutral	Strongly Agree
Perspective of "hassle" from building owners	-	2	4
Communicating benefits to building owners	-	-	3
Understanding/appreciating value of data	-	-	2
How to turn awareness to action	-	-	4
Long return on investments	-	-	6
Costs (auditing + otherwise)	-	-	2
PR - Marketing problem*	-	1	4
Time Intensive	-	-	2
Unsure of how to benchmark (process)	-	2	2
Data collection	-	-	-

Value			
Prompt	Strongly Disagree	Neutral	Strongly Agree
Safer Buildings	1	2	2
Awareness of energy use/cost	-	-	2
Sustainability/Reduced enviro. impact	-	-	2
Saving Energy	-	-	1
Saving Money	-	-	1
Reduce Carbon*	-	1	4
Goodwill w/ the community & clients. Good PR/Marketability*	-	2	3
Job Creation	-	3	-
Understanding Maintenance needs*	-	-	1

Best Practice			
Prompt	Strongly Disagree	Neutral	Strongly Agree
Incentive programs/rebates	-	-	4
Free energy assessments	-	-	5
Support with data interpretation	-	-	4
Rosters of buildings	-	-	1
Maximizing return on investment	-	-	1
Consider local perspectives - what makes most sense to benchmark	-	-	3
Sharing actuals on positive (\$) case studies to get buy in*	-	1	1
Benchmarking assistance resources	-	-	1
Setting correct expectations	-	-	1

* = Prompts written by participants